BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03348 8081

CASES AND MATERIALS ON CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE

Preliminary Sixth Edition

1990

M.L. Friedland

and

Kent Roach

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

PART THREE

DEFENCES AND DISPOSITIONS

LAW LIBRARY
AUG 30 1990
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CASES AND MATERIALS ON CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE

Preliminary Sixth Edition

1990

M.L. Friedland

and

Kent Roach

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

PART THREE

DEFENCES AND DISPOSITIONS

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casesmaterialson03frie

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Part One

THE CRIMINAL PROCESS

		PAGE
1	INTRODUCTION TO CRIMINAL LAW AND PROCEDURE	1
	Excerpt from Studies in Strict Liability	1
	Statistical Breakdown of Criminal Offences in Canada 1988	5
I.	Scheme of the Criminal Code	7
II.	The Criminal Code as Federal Legislation	7
	Excerpt from "Criminal Justice and the Division of Power in Canada"	7
	Switzman v. Elbling	11
	Schneider v. R.	12
III.	Codification: The Criminal As a Statute	14
	A) History of the Criminal Code	14
	Excerpt from "The Criminal Law, 1867-1967"	14
	B) Common Law Defences	16
	Amato v. R.	16
	C) Common Law Offences	17
	Frey v. Fedoruk	17
	D) Note on the Common Law Offence of Contempt of Court	19
	R. v. Cohn	19

	R. v. Martin	20
	R. v. Kopyto	20
	E) Vagueness and Certainty in the Criminal Law	21
	R. v. Heffer	21
	Papachristou et al v. City of Jacksonville	25
	F) Strict Construction of the Criminal Code	28
	R. v. Goulis	28
	R. v. Pare	31
	R. v. Prevost	36
2	THE INVESTIGATION OF CRIME	37
	Excerpt from "Constitutionalizing Disrepute: Exclusion of Evidence After Therens"	38
I.	Questioning Suspects	43
	A) The Common Law Governing Confessions	43
	Boudreau v. The King	43
	B) Confessions and the Right to Counsel	45
	Clarkson v. R.	45
	R. v. Manninen	51
	R. v. Brydges	54
	Miranda v. Arizona	57
	R. v. Rowbotham et al.	59
	C) Jailhouse Confessions	61
	Rothman v. R.	61
	R. v. Hebert	66
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Working Paper 32 Questioning Suspects"	77

	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 23 Questioning Suspects"	77
II.	Entrapment	78
	Kirzner v. The Queen	78
	R. v. Jewitt	80
	R. v. Amato	81
	R. v. Mack	85
	R. v. Showman	90
	Excerpt from "Controlling Entrapment"	91
III.	Search, Seizure and Arrest	93
	A) The Protection of Privacy	93
	Hunter v. Southam	93
	Thomsen Newspapers Ltd. v. Canada	97
	R. v. LeBeau and Lofthouse	99
	B) Prior Judicial Authorization of Search and Seizure	103
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Working Paper 30 Police Powers - Search and Seizure in Criminal Law Enforcement"	103
	A.G. of Nova Scotia v. MacIntyre	104
	R. v. Baylis	104
	C) The Effect of Obtaining a Search Warrant	105
	U.S. v. Leon	105
	D) Exclusion of Evidence Obtained in Violation of Section 8 of the Charter	105
	R. v. Wray	105
	R. v. Collins	106
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 24 Search and Seizure"	112

E) Arrest 115

Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 29 Arrest" 115

R. v. Rao 116

R. v. Morrison 116

Cloutier v. Langlois 116

R. v. Beare 117

R. v. Pithart 117

IV. Constitutional Restraints on the Investigation of Crime: A Case Study of Drunk Driving 119

R. v. Therens 119

R. v. Thomsen 120

R. v. Hufsky 123

R. v. Ladouceur 125

R. v. Dyment 128

3 THE CRIMINAL TRIAL PROCESS 132

I. The Donald Marshall Case 133

Note on Appeals 133

A) Marshall's Appeals 134

R. v. Marshall (1972) 134

R. v. Marshall (1983) 143

B) Excerpt from the "Royal Commission on the Donald Marshall Jr., Prosecution" 148

II. The Role of the Prosecutor and Defence Counsel 160

Boucher v. R. 160

Nelles v. R. 161

Disclosure 162

	Rules of Professional Conduct	162
	R. v. Bourget	162
	Excerpt from "The Royal Commission on the Donald Marshall Jr., Prosecution "	164
	Plea Bargaining	166
	Excerpt from "The Prosecutor"	166
	Adgey v. R.	167
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Working Paper 15 Criminal Procedure: Control of the Process"	172
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Working Paper 60 Plea Discussions and Agreements"	172
	Rules of Professional Conduct	174
	Excerpt from "Defending a Criminal Case"	175
III.	Pre-trial Release	180
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Working Paper 57 Compelling Appearance, Interim Release and Pre-Trial Detention"	181
	R. v. Thompson	182
	R. v. Bray	184
	R. v. Pugsley	185
	R. v. Kevork	186
IV.	Classification of Offences	187
V.	Preliminary Hearing	189
	Patterson v. R.	190
	Caccamo v. R.	193
	R. v. Skogman	195
VI.	Trial Within a Reasonable Time	197
VII.	Pre-Trial Publicity and Change of Venue	198
	R. v. Bryant	198

	R. v. Ebsary	200
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Working Paper 56 Public and Media Access to the Criminal Process"	202
VIII.	The Jury	203
	R. v. Turpin and Siddiqui	203
	R. v. Lyons	209
	R. v. Emile	209
	A) Selecting the Jury	209
	Excerpt from "The Royal Commission on the Donald Marshall Jr., Prosecution"	209
	R. v. Kent et al.	210
	R. v. Favel	210
	R. v. Hubbert	212
	R. v. Zundel	213
	B) Jury Unanimity	216
	Latour v. R.	216
	R. v. Isaac	217
	Thatcher v. R.	219
IX.	Evidence and Argument Before the Jury	221
	R. v. Salmon	221
	Excerpt from "The Royal Commission on the Donald Marshall Jr., Prosecution"	222
	Vezeau v. R.	223
	R. v. Boss	223
	R. v. Corbett	224
X.	Quantum and Burden of Proof	230
	Woolmington v. D.P.P.	230

	R. v. Shelley	235
	R. v. Oakes	236
	R. v. Whyte	239
	R. v. Godfrey	243
	R. v. Metro News	244
	R. v. Schwartz	244
	R. v. Summers	246
	R. v. Hepworth and Fearnley	247
	R. v. Lachance	248
	R. v. Campbell	250
	R. v. Gardiner	250
4	THE LIMITS OF THE CRIMINAL LAW	251
I.	Preliminary Readings	251
	Excerpt from "The Wolfenden Report"	251
	Excerpt from "The Enforcement of Morals"	253
	Excerpt from "The Function of Criminal Law"	257
	Excerpt from "Pornography and Prostitution in Canada"	258
	Bowers v. Hardwick	263
	R. v. Skinner	264
II.	Abortion	268
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Working Paper 58 Crimes Against the Foetus"	268
	R. v. Bourne	269
	R. v. Morgentaler (1974)	275

	R. v. Morgentaler (1975)	275
	R. v. Morgentaler (1988)	280
	Borowski v. A.G. of Canada	290
	Daigle v. Tremblay	290
	Criminal Code Amendment	291
III.	Hate Literature	292
	R. v. Buzzanga and Durocher	293
	R. v. Zundel	296
	R. v. Keegstra	299
	R. v. Andrews	303
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Working Paper 50 Hate Propaganda"	307

Part Two

FUNDAMENTAL PRINCIPLES OF CRIMINAL LIABILITY

		PAGE
5	THE CRIMINAL ACT: EXTERNAL CIRCUMSTANCES OF THE OFFENCE	309
	Excerpt from "Criminal Law"	309
	R. v. Miller	309
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	310
	R. v. Corrier	310
	Fagan v. Commissioner of Metropolitan Police	314
	Bratty v. A.G. for Northern Ireland	317
	R. v. Larsonneur	317
I.	Omissions	318
	Problem	318
	Excerpt from "A Penal Code Prepared by the Indian Law Commissioners"	318
	People v. Beardsley	321
	R. v. Instan	324
	Commonwealth v. Cali	326
	R. v. Miller	327
	Horsley v. MacLaren	328
	Excerpt from "Medicine and the Law - Withholding Paediatric Medical Care"	330
	R. v. Goulis	330
	R. v. Colucci	331
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying	

	Criminal Law"	331
II.	Causation	332
	R. v. Winning	333
	R. v. Jordan	333
	R. v. Smith	335
	People v. Lewis	338
	R. v. Kitching and Adams	339
	R. v. Malcherek	340
	R. v. Green and Harrison	340
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	341
	R. v. Smithers	341
	R. v. Blaue	343
	Pagett v. R.	344
	Excerpt from "Studies in Criminal Law"	346
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	347
III.	Constructive Murder	347
	Excerpt from "From Felony Murder to Accomplice Felony Attempted Murder: The Rake's Progress Compleat?"	347
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Working Paper 33 Homicide"	349
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	353
	Vaillancourt v. R.	354
	R. v. Giff	362
6	ATTEMPT AND RELATED PROBLEMS	365

I.	Mens Rea for an Attempt	365
	Lajoie v. R.	365
	R. v. Ancio	369
	R. v. Logan	372
II.	Actus Reus for an Attempt	373
	R. v. Robinson	373
	D.P.P. v. Stonehouse	377
	R. v. Barker	377
	R. v. Cline	381
	R. v. Sorrell and Bondett	384
	Deutsch v. R.	386
	Davey v. Lee	387
	Balogh v. Crown Court at St. Albans	387
	Excerpt from "English Law Commission's Working Paper No. 50, Inchoate Offences"	387
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	388
	Excerpt from "Should We Have a Law of Attempted Crime?"	389
	Problem	389
III.	Impossibility	390
	R. v. Scott	390
	Booth v. State of Oklahoma	391
	R. v. Donnelly	396
	R. v. Smith (Roger)	397
	Partington v. Williams	402
	Director of Public Prosecutions v. Nock	402

	Detering v. R.	403
	Anderton v. Ryan	403
	R. v. Shivpuri	404
IV.	Other Forms of Involvement: Counselling, Conspiracy, Aiding and Abetting, etc.	405
	R. v. Dungey	405
	A) Counselling	406
	R. v. McLeod	406
	R. v. Richard	407
	B) Aiding and Abetting	408
	R. v. Kulbacki	408
	R. v. Salajko	410
	Dunlop and Sylvester v. R.	411
	R. v. Popen	412
	R. v. Madigan	413
	Poitras v. R.	415
	R. v. Greenlaw	418
	R. v. Meston	418
	Sokolowski v. R.	418
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	419
	C) Common Intention	420
	R. v. Maier and Clark	420
	R. v. Trineer	421
	R. v. Riezebos	424
	R. v. Harris	426
V.	First Degree Murder	429

	Droste v. R.	429
	R. v. Nygaard and Schimmens	429
	R. v. Stevens	431
	R. v. Munro and Munro	432
	R. v. Collins	433
	R. v. Prevost	436
	R. v. Woods and Gruener	439
	R. v. Dollan and Newstead	439
	R. v. Paré	439
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	441
7	THE MENTAL STATE: REQUIREMENTS OF CULPABILITY	443
	R. v. Tolson	443
	Excerpt from "English Law Commission Working Paper No. 31 The Mental Element in Crime"	444
	Excerpt from "The Criminal Law in Canadian Society"	444
I.	Model Penal Code and other Legislative Solutions	445
	Excerpt from "A.L.I. Model Penal Code"	445
	Excerpt from "The Model Penal Code" (Lecture by Professor Wechsler)	446
	Excerpt from "New York Revised Penal Law"	447
	Excerpt from "English Law Commission's Working Paper No. 31, The Mental Element in Crime"	448
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	449
II.	Intent	450
	R. v. Steane	450

	Dunbar v. R.	453
	Paquette v. R.	454
	R. v. George	458
III.	Recklessness / Criminal Negligence	463
	R. v. Titchner	463
	Leblanc v. R.	465
	R. v. Caldwell	465
	R. v. Lawrence	466
	R. v. Tutton and Tutton	466
	R. v. Waite	475
IV.	Presumed Intent	476
	Problem	476
	D.P.P. v. Smith	476
	Parker v. R.	478
	Hyam v. D.P.P.	479
	R. v. Hughes	479
	R. v. Tennant and Naccarato	479
	R. v. Quaranta	481
	R. v. DeWolfe	482
	R. v. Vasil	487
	R. v. Chabot	491
8	STRICT RESPONSIBILITY	492
	R. v. Ping Yuen	492
	R. v. Regina Cold Storage & Forwarding Co. Ltd.	495

	Beaver v. R.	497
	R. v. Pierce Fisheries Ltd.	504
	R. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie	505
	Strasser v. Roberge	510
	R. v. Chapin	511
	Reference Re Section 94(2) of the Motor Vehicle Act	512
	Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Quebec (Attorney-General)	515
	R. v. Metro News Ltd.	516
	R. v Wholesale Travel Group Inc.	519
	Stevens v. R.	521
	R. v. McLeod	523
	Problem	524
9	MISTAKE OF FACT	527
	R. v. Prince	527
	R. v. Rees	531
	D.P.P. v. Morgan	534
	Pappajohn v. R.	535
	Sansregret v. R.	542
	Laybourn, Bulmer and Illingworth v. R.	544
	R. v. Ladue	546
	R. v. Burgess	548
	R. v. Kundeus	549
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	551

10	IGNORANCE OF THE LAW	553
	R. v. Bailey	553
	R. v. Esop	555
	R. v. Ross	555
	Excerpt from "The Ontario Regulations Act"	558
	Excerpt from "The Statutory Instruments Act"	558
	Molis v. R.	559
	R. ex. rel. Irwin v. Dalley	559
	R. v. Prue and Baril	561
	R. v. MacDougall	562
	Boggs v. R.	562
	R. v. Docherty	563
	R. v. Campbell and Mlynarchuk	563
	R. v. MacIntyre	569
	R. v. Maclean	569
	Excerpt from "National Security: The Legal Dimensions"	569
	R. v. Cancoil Thermal Corporation and Parkinson	570
	R. v. Howson	571
	R. v. Shymkowich	573
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	574
11	CORPORATE LIABILITY	576
	R. v. Fane Robinson Ltd.	576
	R. v. Andrews Weatherfoil Ltd	580

R. v. Waterloo Mercury Sales Ltd.	582
R. v. McNamara	584
Canadian Dredge and Dock Co. Ltd. v. R.	587
Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	592
R. v. N.M. Paterson & Sons Ltd.	594
R. v. Amway Corporation and A-G Ont.	594

Part Three

DEFENCES AND DISPOSITIONS

		PAGE
12	**DRUNKENNESS**	595
	Problem	595
	D.P.P. v. Beard	596
I.	Capacity to Form the Intent	604
	Fisher v. R.	604
	R. v. Seguin	607
	Young v. R.	608
II.	Drunkenness and Specific Intent	609
	D.P.P. v. Majewski	609
	Leary v. R.	613
	R. v. Moreau	616
	Swietlinski v. R.	617
	Cooper v. R.	617
	Bernard v. R.	618
	R. v. Quinn	627
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	627
13	**INSANITY**	629
I.	Stages of Criminal Process in Which Insanity May be Relevant	629
	A) Certification Before Trial	629

Excerpt from the Ontario "Mental Health Act" 629

B) Fitness to Stand Trial 632

Excerpt from the Ontario "Mental Health Act" 633

Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law" 634

C) Insanity as a Defence 635

Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 5 Mental Disorder in the Criminal Process" 636

R. v. Saxell 636

R. v. Swain 637

Jones v. United States 639

D) Who Can Raise the Insanity Issue 639

R. v. Simpson 639

R. v. Saxell 640

E) Effect on a Requisite Mental State 641

More v. R. 641

R. v. Baltzer 642

R. v. Wright 643

F) Sentence 643

Excerpt from "Enforcing the Law" 643

Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 5 Mental Disorder in the Criminal Process" 645

R. v. Boomhower 645

R. v. Deans 645

G) Transfer from Penal Institution to Mental Hospital 646

H) Executive Clemency 647

	Excerpt from the "Report of the Royal Commission on the Law of Insanity as a Defence in Criminal Cases"	647
II.	Insanity as a Defence	648
	Problem	648
	M'Naghten's Case	651
	R. v. Simpson	655
	Cooper v. R.	656
	R. v. Windle	657
	R. v. Codere	659
	Excerpt from the "Report of the Royal Commission on the Law of Insanity as a Defence in Criminal Cases"	660
	Schwartz v. R.	664
	Cooper v. R.	669
	R. v. Kjeldsen	671
	R. v. Simpson	671
	R. v. Abbey	671
	R. v. Kirkby	674
	R. v. Landry	675
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Working Paper 29 Criminal Law, The General Part: Liability and Defences"	677
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	677
III.	Alternatives to M'Naghten	678
	Durham v. United States	678
	Brawner	681
	Excerpt from "Abolish the Insanity Defence - Why Not?"	685

	Excerpt from article by Professor Dershowitz	685
IV.	Form of Expert Testimony	688
	Bleta v. R.	688
14	AUTOMATISM	692
	Problem	692
	R. v. Hartridge	692
I.	Conviction for Causing Death	693
	Fain v. Commonwealth of Kentucky	693
	Excerpt from the "Toronto Star"	696
	R. v. Shaw	697
II.	Proving Automatism	698
	Hill v. Baxter	698
III.	Relation to Insanity	701
	R. v. Charlson	701
	R. v. Kemp	704
	R. v. Quick	705
	R. v. Sullivan	708
	R. v. Parks	709
	R. v. Hartridge	709
	R. v. Revelle	710
	R. v. K	710
	Rabey v. R.	715
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	721
IV.	Provocation	722

		Salamon v. R.	722
		Bedder v. D.P.P.	725
		D.P.P. v. Camplin	728
		R. v. Hill (1982)	729
		R. v. Hill (1986)	730
		R. v. Ly	734
		R. v. Galgay	736
		R. v. Nealy	737
15		SOME ASPECTS OF EXCUSABLE CONDUCT: NECESSITY, DURESS, AND SELF-DEFENCE	738
	I.	Necessity	738
		United States v. Holmes	738
		R. v. Dudley and Stephens	744
		Morgentaler v. R. (1975)	748
		Perka v. R.	753
		R. v. Morgentaler (1985)	759
		Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	760
	II.	Duress	761
		R. v. Carker	762
		R. v. Hudson and Taylor	766
		R. v. Morrison and McQueen	768
		Abbott v. R.	770
		R. v. Howe	772
		Excerpt from "English Law Commission Working Paper No. 55"	773

	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	773
III.	Self-Defence	774
	Brown v. United States	775
	R. v. Lavallee	776
	R. v. Reilly	785
	People v. Bernard Goetz	786
	Excerpt from "A Crime of Self-Defence"	788
	Beckford v. R.	789
	R. v. Reilly	790
	Brisson v. R.	791
	R. v. Faid	791
	Excerpt from "L.R.C. Report 31 Recodifying Criminal Law"	792
16	DOUBLE JEOPARDY	793
	Green v. United States	793
	R. v. Shubley	794
I.	Early Termination	797
	R. v. Karpinsky	797
	R. v. T.C.D.	799
	Re Parkin and The Queen	800
	R. v. Moore	801
II.	When Will a Dismissal be a Bar?	803
	R. v. Riddle	803
	Petersen v. R.	806
	R. v. Conrad	807

	R. v. Tateham	807
III.	The Special Pleas	808
	R. v. Barron	808
	R. v. Rinnie	810
	Luckett v. R.	812
IV.	Issue Estoppel	813
	R. v. Carlson	813
	R. v. Feeley, McDermott and Wright	819
	R. v. Gushue (1973)	820
	R. v. Gushue (1976)	822
	Gushue v. R. (1979)	822
	Grdic v. R.	824
	R. v. Segal	825
	R. v. Elmosri	825
V.	Splitting a Case	827
	Connelly v. D.P.P.	827
	R. v. Osborn	831
	Rourke v. R.	831
	R. v. Jewitt	832
	R. v. B.	834
VI.	Multiple Convictions	836
	Kienapple v. R.	836
	Côté v. R.	836
	R. v. Hagenlocher	837
	Krug v. R.	837
	R. v. Prince	838

	R. v. Wigman	840
VII.	Appeals and New Trials	841
	Excerpt from "Report of the Departmental Committee on New Trials in Criminal cases"	841
	Vezeau v. R.	842
	R. v. Morin	843
	Hill v. R.	844
	R. v. Century 21 Ramos Realty	844
VIII.	Problems in a Divided Jurisdiction	846
	R. v. Kissick	846
	United States v. Lanza	848
	Abbate v. United States	848
17	SENTENCING	850
I.	Problems	850
II.	General Principles	852
	R. v. Pearce	852
	R. v. Hinch and Salanski	855
	R. v. Sumarah	861
	R. v. Morrisette	865
	R. v. Sandercock	869
	Excerpt from "Sentencing Reform A Canadian Approach"	873
	R. v. Ebsary	878
	R. v. Gardiner	880
III.	Constitutional Considerations	882

	Reference Re Section 94(2) of the B.C. Motor Vehicle Act	882
	R. v. Smith	883
	R. v. Mitchell	887
	A Note on Parole and Remission	887
	A Note on Indeterminate Detention	888
	R. v. Lyons	888
	R. v. Milne	889
IV.	Sentencing Options Other than Imprisonment	890
	Excerpt from "Sentencing Reform A Canadian Approach"	890
	A Note on Absolute and Conditional Discharge	890
	A Note on Probation	891
	A Note on Restitution	891
	A Note on Fines	891
	R. v. Hebb	892
V.	Gender and Race Considerations in Sentencing	896
	R. v. Fireman	896
	R. v. Naquitaruik	899
VI.	Sentencing Policy and Reform	902
	Excerpt from "Sentencing Reform A Canadian Approach"	903